

PEDIATRICS

OFFICIAL JOURNAL OF THE AMERICAN ACADEMY OF PEDIATRICS

COVID-19 Transmission and Children: The Child is Not to Blame

Benjamin Lee, MD and William V. Raszka, Jr., MD

DOI: 10.1542/peds.2020-004879

Journal: *Pediatrics*

Article Type: Commentary

Citation: Lee B, Raszka Jr WV. COVID-19 transmission and children: the child is not to blame. *Pediatrics*. 2020; doi: 10.1542/peds.2020-004879

This is a pre-publication version of an article that has undergone peer review and been accepted for publication but is not the final version of record. This paper may be cited using the DOI and date of access. This paper may contain information that has errors in facts, figures, and statements, and will be corrected in the final published version. The journal is providing an early version of this article to expedite access to this information. The American Academy of Pediatrics, the editors, and authors are not responsible for inaccurate information and data described in this version.

COVID-19 Transmission and Children: The Child is Not to Blame

Benjamin Lee, MD and William V. Raszka, Jr., MD

Affiliation: University of Vermont Larner College of Medicine, Burlington, Vermont

Address correspondence to:

William V. Raszka Jr.
Department of Pediatrics
University of Vermont, Larner College of Medicine
89 Beaumont Ave, Given Courtyard N210
Burlington VT 05405

Short title: COVID-19 transmission and children

Funding Source: No funding was secured for this work.

Financial Disclosure: The authors have no financial relationships relevant to this article to disclose.

Potential Conflict of Interest: The authors have no conflicts of interest to disclose.

Abbreviations: COVID-19, coronavirus disease 2019; HHC, household contact; RT-PCR, reverse-transcription polymerase chain reaction; SARS-CoV-2, severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2

COVID-19 presents arguably the greatest public health crisis in living memory. One surprising aspect of this pandemic is that children appear to be infected by SARS-CoV-2, the virus that causes COVID-19, far less frequently than adults, and when infected typically have mild symptoms,¹⁻³ although emerging reports of a novel Kawasaki disease-like multi-system inflammatory syndrome necessitate continued surveillance in pediatric patients.^{4,5} However, a major question remains unanswered: to what extent are children responsible for SARS-CoV-2 transmission? Resolving this issue is central to making informed public health decisions, ranging from how to safely re-open schools, childcare facilities, and summer camps, down to the precautions needed to obtain a throat culture in an uncooperative child. To date, few published data are available to help guide these decisions.

In this issue of *Pediatrics*, Posfay-Barbe and colleagues report on the dynamics of COVID-19 within families of children with reverse-transcription polymerase chain reaction (RT-PCR)-confirmed SARS-CoV-2 infection in Geneva, Switzerland.⁶ From March 10 – April 10, 2020, all children <16 years of age diagnosed at Geneva University Hospital (N=40) underwent contact tracing to identify infected household contacts (HHC). Of 39 evaluable households, in only three (8%) was a child the suspected index case, with symptom onset preceding illness in adult HHCs. In all other households, the child developed symptoms after or concurrent with adult HHCs, suggesting that the child was not the source of infection, and that children most frequently acquire COVID-19 from adults, rather than transmitting it to them.

These findings are consistent with other recently published household contact investigations in China. Of 68 children with confirmed COVID-19 admitted to Qingdao Women's and Children's Hospital from January 20 – February 27, 2020, and with complete epidemiological data, 65 (95.59%) cases were HHCs of previously infected adults.⁷ Of 10

children hospitalized outside Wuhan, China, in only one was there possible child to adult transmission, based on symptom chronology.⁸ Similarly, transmission of SARS-CoV-2 by children outside household settings seems uncommon, although information is limited. In an intriguing study from France, a nine year-old boy with respiratory symptoms associated with picornavirus, influenza A, and SARS-CoV-2 coinfection was found to have exposed over 80 classmates at three schools; no secondary contacts became infected, despite numerous influenza infections within the schools, suggesting an environment conducive to respiratory virus transmission.⁹ In New South Wales, Australia, nine students and nine staff infected with SARS-CoV-2 across 15 schools had close contact with a total of 735 students and 128 staff.¹⁰ Only two secondary infections were identified, none in adult staff; one student in primary school was potentially infected by a staff member, and one student in high school was potentially infected via exposure to two infected schoolmates.

Based on these data, SARS-CoV-2 transmission in schools may be less important in community transmission than initially feared. This would be another manner by which SARS-CoV-2 differs drastically from influenza, for which school-based transmission is well recognized as a significant driver of epidemic disease and forms the basis for most evidence regarding school closures as public health strategy.^{11,12} While two reports are far from definitive, they provide early reassurance that school-based transmission could be a manageable problem and school closures may not have to be a foregone conclusion, particularly for elementary school aged-children who appear to be at the lowest risk of infection. Additional support comes from mathematical models, which find that school closures alone may be insufficient to halt epidemic spread¹³ and have modest overall impacts compared to broader, community-wide physical distancing measures.¹⁴

These data all suggest that children are not significant drivers of the COVID-19 pandemic. It is unclear why documented SARS-CoV-2 transmission from children to other children or adults is so infrequent. In 47 COVID-19 infected German children, nasopharyngeal SARS-CoV-2 viral loads were similar to those in other age groups, raising concern that children could be as infectious as adults.¹⁵ Because SARS-CoV-2-infected children are so frequently mildly symptomatic, they may have weaker and less frequent cough, releasing fewer infectious particles into the surrounding environment. Another possibility is that because school closures occurred in most locations along with or prior to widespread physical distancing orders, most close contacts became limited to households, reducing opportunities for children to become infected in the community and present as index cases.

Almost six months into the pandemic, accumulating evidence and collective experience argue that children, particularly school-aged children, are far less important drivers of SARS-CoV-2 transmission than adults. Therefore, serious consideration should be paid towards strategies that allow schools to remain open, even during periods of COVID-19 spread. In doing so, we could minimize the potentially profound adverse social, developmental, and health costs that our children will continue to suffer until an effective treatment or vaccine can be developed and distributed, or failing that, until we reach herd immunity.^{16,17}

References

1. Coronavirus Disease 2019 in Children - United States, February 12-April 2, 2020. *MMWR Morbidity and mortality weekly report*. 2020;69(14):422-426. doi:10.15585/mmwr.mm6914e4.
2. Dong Y, Mo X, Hu Y, Qi X, Jiang F, Jiang Z, et al. Epidemiology of COVID-19 Among Children in China. *Pediatrics*. 2020. doi:10.1542/peds.2020-0702.
3. Wu Z, McGoogan JM. Characteristics of and Important Lessons From the Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) Outbreak in China: Summary of a Report of 72314 Cases From the Chinese Center for Disease Control and Prevention. *JAMA*. 2020. doi:10.1001/jama.2020.2648.
4. Riphagen S, Gomez X, Gonzalez-Martinez C, Wilkinson N, Theocharis P. Hyperinflammatory shock in children during COVID-19 pandemic. *Lancet*. 2020. doi:10.1016/s0140-6736(20)31094-1.
5. Verdoni L, Mazza A, Gervasoni A, et al. An outbreak of severe Kawasaki-like disease at the Italian epicentre of the SARS-CoV-2 epidemic: an observational cohort study. *Lancet* 2020. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(20)31103-X.
6. Posfay-Barbe K, Wagner N, Gauthey M, et al. COVID-19 in children and the dynamics of infection in families. IN PRESS this issue. *Pediatrics*. 2020.
7. Wu Q, Zing Y, Shi L, Li W, Gao Y, Pan S, et al. Co-infection and other clinical characteristics of COVID-19 in children. *Pediatrics*. 2020. doi:10.1542/peds.2020-0961.
8. Cai J, Xu J, Lin D, et al. A Case Series of children with 2019 novel coronavirus infection: clinical and epidemiological features. *Clinical infectious diseases : an official publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America*. 2020. doi:10.1093/cid/ciaa198.
9. Danis K, Epaulard O, Benet T, et al. Cluster of coronavirus disease 2019 (Covid-19) in the French Alps, 2020. *Clinical infectious diseases : an official publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America*. 2020. doi:10.1093/cid/ciaa424.
10. COVID-19 in schools - the experience in NSW. National Centre for Immunisation Research and Surveillance. New South Wales, Australia. April 26, 2020.
11. Cauchemez S, Valleron AJ, Boelle PY, Flahault A, Ferguson NM. Estimating the impact of school closure on influenza transmission from Sentinel data. *Nature*. 2008;452(7188):750-754. doi:10.1038/nature06732.
12. Litvinova M, Liu QH, Kulikov ES, Ajelli M. Reactive school closure weakens the network of social interactions and reduces the spread of influenza. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*. 2019;116(27):13174-13181. doi:10.1073/pnas.1821298116.
13. Zhang J, Litvinova M, Liang Y, et al. Changes in contact patterns shape the dynamics of the COVID-19 outbreak in China. *Science (New York, NY)*. 2020. doi:10.1126/science.abb8001.
14. Ferguson NM, Laydon D, Nedjati-Gilani G, et al. Impact of non-pharmaceutical interventions (NPIs) to reduce COVID-19 mortality and healthcare demand. . Imperial College London (16-03-2020). doi:<https://doi.org/10.25561/77482>.
15. Jones TC, Muhlemann B, Veith T, et al. An analysis of SARS-CoV-2 viral load by patient age. *Research network zoonotic infectious diseases*. 2020; published online Apr 30. https://zoonosen.charite.de/fileadmin/user_upload/microsites/m_cc05/virologie-

[ccm/dateien_upload/Weitere_Dateien/analysis-of-SARS-CoV-2-viral-load-by-patient-age.pdf](#). Accessed online April 30, 2020

16. Christakis DA. School Reopening-The Pandemic Issue That Is Not Getting Its Due. *JAMA pediatrics*. 2020. doi:10.1001/jamapediatrics.2020.2068.
17. Esposito S, Principi N. School Closure During the Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) Pandemic: An Effective Intervention at the Global Level? *JAMA pediatrics*. 2020. doi:10.1001/jamapediatrics.2020.1892.

COVID-19 Transmission and Children: The Child is Not to Blame

Benjamin Lee and William V. Raszka Jr.

Pediatrics originally published online May 26, 2020;

Updated Information & Services

including high resolution figures, can be found at:
<http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/early/2020/05/22/peds.2020-004879.citation>

Permissions & Licensing

Information about reproducing this article in parts (figures, tables) or in its entirety can be found online at:
<http://www.aappublications.org/site/misc/Permissions.xhtml>

Reprints

Information about ordering reprints can be found online:
<http://www.aappublications.org/site/misc/reprints.xhtml>

American Academy of Pediatrics

DEDICATED TO THE HEALTH OF ALL CHILDREN®



PEDIATRICS®

OFFICIAL JOURNAL OF THE AMERICAN ACADEMY OF PEDIATRICS

COVID-19 Transmission and Children: The Child is Not to Blame

Benjamin Lee and William V. Raszka Jr.

Pediatrics originally published online May 26, 2020;

The online version of this article, along with updated information and services, is located on the World Wide Web at:

<http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/early/2020/05/22/peds.2020-004879.citation>

Pediatrics is the official journal of the American Academy of Pediatrics. A monthly publication, it has been published continuously since 1948. Pediatrics is owned, published, and trademarked by the American Academy of Pediatrics, 345 Park Avenue, Itasca, Illinois, 60143. Copyright © 2020 by the American Academy of Pediatrics. All rights reserved. Print ISSN: 1073-0397.

American Academy of Pediatrics

DEDICATED TO THE HEALTH OF ALL CHILDREN®

