

## RE: Room-sharing Versus Bed-sharing

This report has a combined section on room-sharing and bed-sharing (recommendation #4). As such, it is difficult to discern the sudden unexpected infant death-reducing effectiveness of a separate bed versus a shared room. Does the up to 50% reduction apply to both or just room-sharing? All else equal, what is the reduction in infant deaths between children sleeping in their own bed in their caregivers' room versus sleeping in their own bed in their own room?

Chris Cooper, Father  
E-mail: [chris\\_d\\_cooper@outlook.com](mailto:chris_d_cooper@outlook.com)

**CONFLICT OF INTEREST:** None declared.

doi:10.1542/peds.2016-4132A

## RE: Room-sharing Until 12 Months

It is very difficult to take issue with something as serious and well intentioned as guidelines to prevent sudden unexpected infant death. However, there are some major unknowns, which make these recommendations unreasonable and even questionable from a child development and family relationships perspective.

All 4 of the studies cited to support room-sharing were conducted with samples of European parents and European infants. Yes, from a life-saving perspective, it might make sense that parents in the United States are in the same room as their infants for the first year (this scenario has not been studied yet, as just noted), but is this something that parents in our American culture can do? American families are living under very different contexts than European families; most notably, American mothers are expected to (and do return to) work when their infants are much younger in age than their European counterparts.<sup>1</sup> This difference warrants further consideration by the task force

representing the American Academy of Pediatrics because these recommendations are being given to mothers who are living under different cultural expectations than mothers of infants in Europe.

Infants in their second half-year of life are more aware of the world around them and, later in their second half-year of life, are developmentally capable of engaging in acts such as vocalizing to get the attention of their parents. Researchers should investigate how room-sharing affects parental sleep deprivation and parents' stress.

Transitioning an infant aged <6 months from room-sharing to his or her own crib is likely much easier than transitioning a 12-month-old. Infants in the later part of their second half-year of life are extremely aware of the world around them and are used to routines. It seems highly improbable that the transition from room-sharing to sleeping independently will happen without the infant (and, in turn, their parents) encountering lots of stress if it is done at 1 year of age.

The members of the Task Force on Sudden Infant Death Syndrome who wrote the 2016 recommendations are a highly respected group of medical physicians with expertise in pediatrics, family medicine, and public health. However, their recommendation that children room-share until 12 months of age might not be realistic or optimal at all from both a child development and family relations perspective. This recommendation should be investigated by researchers studying sleep safety in the United States from a public health perspective that is more sensitive to the emotional needs of infants and the unique cultural context of families living in the United States.

Leslie A. Frankel  
Assistant Professor, Psychological, Health, and  
Learning Sciences, University of Houston  
E-mail: [lafrankel@uh.edu](mailto:lafrankel@uh.edu)

**CONFLICT OF INTEREST:** None declared.

## REFERENCE

1. Berger LM, Hill J, Waldfogel J. Maternity leave, early maternal employment and child health and development in the US. *The Economic Journal*. 2005;115(501): F29–F47

doi:10.1542/peds.2016-4132B

## Author's Response

Mr Cooper and Dr Frankel have questioned the recommendation that infants sleep in the parental bedroom, on a separate sleep surface close to the parents' bed, ideally for 1 year but at least for 6 months.<sup>1</sup>

First, we would like to note that the 2016 policy statement is not significantly different from the 2011 policy statement with regard to room-sharing. For some inexplicable reason, the media chose to highlight the "room-sharing ideally for a year, but at least for 6 months" as an important and more stringent change. In fact, in 2011, our recommendation was that all of the recommendations should be followed until the infant is 1 year of age. Thus, this advice was a loosening of the recommendations. We believe that the most important changes in the recommendations about sleep location are as follows: (1) infants should never fall asleep on couches, sofas, or cushioned chairs; and (2) parents who might fall asleep while feeding their infant in their adult bed should rid the bed of any extraneous bedding.

Case-control studies in England, New Zealand, and Scotland have shown that room-sharing decreases the risk of sudden infant death syndrome compared with sleeping in a separate room. Our statement that the decline in risk was ~50% is very conservative. The study by Blair et al<sup>2</sup> found that the adjusted odds ratio of death for infants who slept in a separate room, compared with those who slept in the parents' room, was 10.49 (95% confidence interval [CI], 4.26–25.81). The New Zealand Cot Death study found that infants who room-shared

## RE: Room-sharing Until 12 Months

Leslie A. Frankel

*Pediatrics* 2017;139;

DOI: 10.1542/peds.2016-4132B originally published online February 28, 2017;

<b>Updated Information &amp; Services</b>	including high resolution figures, can be found at: <a href="http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/139/3/e20164132B">http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/139/3/e20164132B</a>
<b>References</b>	This article cites 1 articles, 0 of which you can access for free at: <a href="http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/139/3/e20164132B#BIBL">http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/139/3/e20164132B#BIBL</a>
<b>Subspecialty Collections</b>	This article, along with others on similar topics, appears in the following collection(s): <b>Fetus/Newborn Infant</b> <a href="http://www.aappublications.org/cgi/collection/fetus:newborn_infant_sub">http://www.aappublications.org/cgi/collection/fetus:newborn_infant_sub</a> <b>SIDS</b> <a href="http://www.aappublications.org/cgi/collection/sids_sub">http://www.aappublications.org/cgi/collection/sids_sub</a>
<b>Permissions &amp; Licensing</b>	Information about reproducing this article in parts (figures, tables) or in its entirety can be found online at: <a href="http://www.aappublications.org/site/misc/Permissions.xhtml">http://www.aappublications.org/site/misc/Permissions.xhtml</a>
<b>Reprints</b>	Information about ordering reprints can be found online: <a href="http://www.aappublications.org/site/misc/reprints.xhtml">http://www.aappublications.org/site/misc/reprints.xhtml</a>

American Academy of Pediatrics

DEDICATED TO THE HEALTH OF ALL CHILDREN™



# PEDIATRICS®

OFFICIAL JOURNAL OF THE AMERICAN ACADEMY OF PEDIATRICS

## **RE: Room-sharing Until 12 Months**

Leslie A. Frankel

*Pediatrics* 2017;139;

DOI: 10.1542/peds.2016-4132B originally published online February 28, 2017;

The online version of this article, along with updated information and services, is located on the World Wide Web at:

<http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/139/3/e20164132B>

Pediatrics is the official journal of the American Academy of Pediatrics. A monthly publication, it has been published continuously since 1948. Pediatrics is owned, published, and trademarked by the American Academy of Pediatrics, 141 Northwest Point Boulevard, Elk Grove Village, Illinois, 60007. Copyright © 2017 by the American Academy of Pediatrics. All rights reserved. Print ISSN: 1073-0397.

American Academy of Pediatrics

DEDICATED TO THE HEALTH OF ALL CHILDREN™

