

Vaccines: Can Transparency Increase Confidence and Reduce Hesitancy?

AUTHOR: Carrie L. Byington, MD, FAAP

Department of Pediatrics, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, Utah

KEY WORDS

vaccine safety, vaccine confidence

ABBREVIATIONS

Hib—*Haemophilus influenzae* type b

IOM—Institute of Medicine

MMR—measles, mumps, and rubella

Opinions expressed in these commentaries are those of the author and not necessarily those of the American Academy of Pediatrics or its Committees.

www.pediatrics.org/cgi/doi/10.1542/peds.2014-1494

doi:10.1542/peds.2014-1494

Accepted for publication May 22, 2014

Address correspondence to Carrie L. Byington, MD, University of Utah Health Sciences Center, 26 2000 East, HSEB Suite 5515, Salt Lake City, UT. E-mail: carrie.byington@hsc.utah.edu

PEDIATRICS (ISSN Numbers: Print, 0031-4005; Online, 1098-4275).

Copyright © 2014 by the American Academy of Pediatrics

FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE: Dr Byington has intellectual property in and receives royalties from BioFire Diagnostics, Inc, Salt Lake City, Utah.

FUNDING: HA and Edna Benning Presidential Endowment; National Center for Advancing Translational Sciences of the National Institutes of Health under award 1ULTR001067. The content is solely the responsibility of the authors and does not necessarily represent the official views of the NIH. Funded by the National Institutes of Health (NIH).

POTENTIAL CONFLICT OF INTEREST: The author has indicated she has no potential conflicts of interest to disclose.

COMPANION PAPER: A companion to this article can be found on page XXX, and online at www.pediatrics.org/cgi/doi/10.1542/peds.2014-1079.



Vaccines are one of the most successful public health achievements of the 20th century^{1–3} and have contributed to improved health and longevity for millions of people in the United States.^{2–4} Between 1900 and 2000 the average life expectancy in the United States increased by >30 years, from 43.7 to 76.8 years, and infant mortality through 12 months of age decreased from 100 per 1000 population to <7 per 1000 population.^{2,5} The decrease or elimination of vaccine-preventable infections played a critical role in these population outcomes that have positively influenced the health, growth, and economy of our nation.

An evaluation of the US vaccine program from 1900 to 1998 demonstrated reduction or elimination of many infectious diseases that had resulted in substantial childhood morbidity and mortality, including smallpox, diphtheria, pertussis, tetanus, polio, measles, mumps, rubella, and *Haemophilus influenzae* type b (Hib).² Newer vaccines, including those that target pneumococci, human papilloma virus, influenza, rotavirus, and varicella, are also reducing morbidity and mortality. Modeling of vaccine impact demonstrates that routine childhood immunizations in the 2009 US birth cohort would prevent ~42 000 deaths and 20 million cases of disease and save \$13.5 billion in direct health care costs and \$68.8 billion in societal costs.³ The Vaccines for Children program, operating since 1994 to provide vaccines at no cost to low-income children, has eliminated racial and ethnic disparities in immunization coverage, ensuring that all US children have an opportunity to enjoy the benefits of vaccines.⁶

Despite the public health triumphs of vaccines or perhaps because the triumphs have created an environment where the ravages of vaccine-preventable disease have been forgotten, confidence in vaccines has decreased in the 21st century, and the number of parents who hesitate to immunize their children is increasing.⁷ Rates of nonmedical personal exemptions for vaccines are also increasing and have been associated with outbreaks of vaccine-preventable infections, including pertussis and measles.^{8,9}

Parental concerns about vaccine safety have been recognized as an important factor that may result in delaying or forgoing vaccines.^{10,11} However, the US commitment to vaccine safety is multilayered and includes rigorous prelicensure studies reviewed by the Food and Drug Administration and both active and passive surveillance systems through the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention Vaccine Safety Datalink and the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention and Food and Drug Administration Vaccine Adverse Events Reporting System. The systematic evaluation of published studies by Maglione et al¹² adds another layer of transparency to evaluation of vaccine safety in the United States. The evidence report, commissioned by the Agency for Health Research and Quality, describes the adverse events associated

with vaccines in routine use in the United States for children ≤ 6 years old. The data presented confirm and update the 2011 Institute of Medicine (IOM) report⁵ and expand the scope of the report to include Hib, hepatitis A, pneumococcal conjugate 13, rotavirus, and inactivated polio vaccines.

In this well-done analysis, the authors present high-quality evidence that there is no association of childhood leukemia with numerous vaccines and no association of autism with the measles, mumps, and rubella (MMR) vaccine. The authors present moderate-quality evidence of no association of the diphtheria, tetanus, and acellular pertussis vaccine with diabetes mellitus, no association of the hepatitis B vaccine with multiple sclerosis, and no association of serious adverse events with the Hib vaccine.

The authors did report adverse events associated with vaccines, including high-quality evidence that the MMR vaccine is associated with febrile seizures and the varicella vaccine is associated with complications in immune-deficient people. There was moderate-quality evidence for purpura associated with the hepatitis A and MMR vaccines, febrile seizures with the pneumococcal conjugate 13 vaccine, and intussusception with rotavirus vaccines.

The adverse events identified by the authors in their evidence review were not unexpected. Clinicians who immunize children regularly may have encountered these adverse events in their practices, particularly seizures associated with fever. Fortunately, the adverse events identified by the authors were rare and in most cases would be expected to resolve completely after the acute event. This contrasts starkly with the natural infections that vaccines are designed to prevent, which may reduce the quality of life through permanent morbidities, such as blindness, deafness, developmental delay, epilepsy, or paralysis and may also result in death.

The findings of the IOM report and of the Maglione et al study should be reassuring to parents of young children and to the clinicians who care for them. However, a recent report evaluating the effectiveness of messages designed to reduce parental misperceptions and increase vaccination rates, including messages about vaccine safety, demonstrated that these messages were ineffective and in some groups of parents may even reduce the intention to vaccinate.¹³ These data suggest that alternative strategies to bolster parental confidence in vaccine safety are needed.

If parents are not convinced by safety data, perhaps these data can be used to

increase clinicians' confidence in the safety of the US vaccine schedule. Data indicate that recent medical graduates are more skeptical of vaccine efficacy than older graduates,¹⁴ and in 1 state more than one-half of medical providers were willing to consider untested immunization schedules for at least some vaccines.¹⁵

The relationship between parents of young children and their medical providers is powerful. Parents trust their child's doctor over government officials, family members, or celebrities as the best source of information on vaccine safety.^{16,17} Furthermore, there is concordance between the beliefs of parents and the beliefs of their child's health provider about vaccine safety.¹⁸ Importantly, data also demonstrate that for parents who are hesitant to immunize their children but who ultimately do so, it is the physician's recommendation that is most often cited as the reason they chose to vaccinate. Clinicians can examine the nonbiased data presented in the IOM report and the report by Maglione et al to increase their own confidence in vaccine safety and their advocacy for vaccines. Ideally, provider confidence in vaccine safety will increase the confidence of the families they serve and increase vaccination rates for children, safeguarding the health of the nation.

REFERENCES

1. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). Ten great public health achievements—United States, 1900–1999. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep.* 1999;48(12):241–243
2. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). Impact of vaccines universally recommended for children—United States, 1990–1998. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep.* 1999;48(12):243–248
3. Zhou F, Shefer A, Wenger J, et al. Economic evaluation of the routine childhood immunization program in the United States, 2009. *Pediatrics.* 2014;133(4):577–585
4. Whitney CG, Zhou F, Singleton J, Schuchat A; National Center for Immunization and Respiratory Diseases, CDC. Benefits from immunization during the vaccines for children program era: United States, 1994–2013. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep.* 2014; 63(16):352–355
5. Institute of Medicine. Adverse effects of vaccines: evidence and causality. In: Stratton K, Ford A, Rusch E, Clayton EW, eds. *Adverse Effects of Vaccines: Evidence and Causality.* Washington, DC: National Academies Press; 2011
6. Walker AT, Smith PJ, Kolasa M; National Center for Emerging and Zoonotic Diseases, CDC. Reduction of racial/ethnic disparities in vaccination coverage, 1995–2011. *MMWR Surveill Summ.* 2014;63(Suppl 1):7–12
7. Larson HJ, Jarrett C, Eckersberger E, Smith DM, Paterson P. Understanding vaccine hesitancy around vaccines and vaccination from a global perspective: a systematic review of published literature, 2007–2012. *Vaccine.* 2014;32(19):2150–2159
8. Richards JL, Wagenaar BH, Van Otterloo J, et al. Nonmedical exemptions to immunization

- requirements in California: a 16-year longitudinal analysis of trends and associated community factors. *Vaccine*. 2013;31(29):3009–3013
9. Constable C, Blank NR, Caplan AL. Rising rates of vaccine exemptions: problems with current policy and more promising remedies. *Vaccine*. 2014;32(16):1793–1797
 10. Healy CM, Montesinos DP, Middleman AB. Parent and provider perspectives on immunization: are providers overestimating parental concerns? *Vaccine*. 2014;32(5):579–584
 11. Lavail KH, Kennedy AM. The role of attitudes about vaccine safety, efficacy, and value in explaining parents' reported vaccination behavior. *Health Educ Behav*. 2013;40(5):544–551
 12. Maglione M, Lopamudra D, Raaen L, et al. Safety of vaccines used for routine immunization of U.S. children: a systematic review. *Pediatrics*. 2014
 13. Nyhan B, Reifler J, Richey S, Freed GL. Effective messages in vaccine promotion: a randomized trial. *Pediatrics*. 2014;133(4). Available at: www.pediatrics.org/cgi/content/full/133/4/e835
 14. Mergler M, Omer S, Pan W, et al. Are recent medical graduates more skeptical of vaccines? *Vaccines*. 2013;1(2):154–166
 15. Wightman A, Opel DJ, Marcuse EK, Taylor JA. Washington State pediatricians' attitudes toward alternative childhood immunization schedules. *Pediatrics*. 2011;128(6):1094–1099
 16. Freed GL, Clark SJ, Butchart AT, Singer DC, Davis MM. Sources and perceived credibility of vaccine-safety information for parents. *Pediatrics*. 2011;127(suppl 1):S107–S112
 17. McCauley MM, Kennedy A, Basket M, Sheedy K. Exploring the choice to refuse or delay vaccines: a national survey of parents of 6-through 23-month-olds. *Acad Pediatr*. 2012;12(5):375–383
 18. Mergler MJ, Omer SB, Pan WK, et al. Association of vaccine-related attitudes and beliefs between parents and health care providers. *Vaccine*. 2013;31(41):4591–4595

Vaccines: Can Transparency Increase Confidence and Reduce Hesitancy?

Carrie L. Byington

Pediatrics originally published online July 1, 2014;

Updated Information & Services

including high resolution figures, can be found at:
<http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/early/2014/06/26/peds.2014-1494.citation>

Permissions & Licensing

Information about reproducing this article in parts (figures, tables) or in its entirety can be found online at:
<http://www.aappublications.org/site/misc/Permissions.xhtml>

Reprints

Information about ordering reprints can be found online:
<http://www.aappublications.org/site/misc/reprints.xhtml>

American Academy of Pediatrics

DEDICATED TO THE HEALTH OF ALL CHILDREN™



PEDIATRICS®

OFFICIAL JOURNAL OF THE AMERICAN ACADEMY OF PEDIATRICS

Vaccines: Can Transparency Increase Confidence and Reduce Hesitancy?

Carrie L. Byington

Pediatrics originally published online July 1, 2014;

The online version of this article, along with updated information and services, is located on the World Wide Web at:

<http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/early/2014/06/26/peds.2014-1494.citation>

Pediatrics is the official journal of the American Academy of Pediatrics. A monthly publication, it has been published continuously since 1948. Pediatrics is owned, published, and trademarked by the American Academy of Pediatrics, 141 Northwest Point Boulevard, Elk Grove Village, Illinois, 60007. Copyright © 2014 by the American Academy of Pediatrics. All rights reserved. Print ISSN: 1073-0397.

American Academy of Pediatrics

DEDICATED TO THE HEALTH OF ALL CHILDREN™

