Sexual Activity–Related Outcomes After Human Papillomavirus Vaccination of 11- to 12-Year-Olds

WHAT’S KNOWN ON THIS SUBJECT: Concerns persist about sexual disinhibition after human papillomavirus (HPV) vaccination of preteenage girls. Self-reported surveys have indicated few anticipated behavior changes after HPV vaccination. Little is known about sexual activity–related clinical outcomes after HPV vaccination.

WHAT THIS STUDY ADDS: Utilizing managed care organization electronic data, we evaluated the incidence of adverse outcomes of sexual activity among vaccinated preteenage girls and found little difference between those who received HPV vaccine and those who did not.

abstract

OBJECTIVE: Previous surveys on hypothesized sexual activity changes after human papillomavirus (HPV) vaccination may be subject to self-response biases. To date, no studies measured clinical markers of sexual activity after HPV vaccination. This study evaluated sexual activity–related clinical outcomes after adolescent vaccination.

METHODS: We conducted a retrospective cohort study utilizing longitudinal electronic data from a large managed care organization. Girls enrolled in the managed care organization, aged 11 through 12 years between July 2006 and December 2007, were classified by adolescent vaccine (HPV; tetanus toxoid, reduced diphtheria toxoid, and acellular pertussis, adsorbed; quadrivalent meningococcal conjugate) receipt. Outcomes (pregnancy/sexually transmitted infection testing or diagnosis; contraceptive counseling) were assessed through December 31, 2010, providing up to 3 years of follow-up. Incidence rate ratios comparing vaccination categories were estimated with multivariate Poisson regression, adjusting for health care–seeking behavior and demographic characteristics.

RESULTS: The cohort included 1398 girls (493 HPV vaccine–exposed; 905 HPV vaccine–unexposed). Risk of the composite outcome (any pregnancy/sexually transmitted infection testing or diagnosis or contraceptive counseling) was not significantly elevated in HPV vaccine–exposed girls relative to HPV vaccine–unexposed girls (adjusted incidence rate ratio: 1.29, 95% confidence interval [CI]: 0.92 to 1.80; incidence rate difference: 1.6/100 person-years; 95% CI: −0.03 to 3.24). Incidence rate difference for Chlamydia infection (0.06/100 person-years [95% CI: −0.30 to 0.18]) and pregnancy diagnoses (0.07/100 person-years [95% CI: −0.20 to 0.35]), indicating little clinically meaningful absolute risk differences.

CONCLUSIONS: HPV vaccination in the recommended ages was not associated with increased sexual activity–related outcome rates. Pediatrics 2012;130:798–805

AUTHORS: Robert A. Bednarczyk, PhD,a,b Robert Davis, MD, MPH,a Kevin Ault, MD,a Walter Orenstein, MD, PhD,c,d and Saad B. Omer, MBBS, PhD, MPHab,c,d

aCenter for Health Research-Southeast, Kaiser Permanente, Atlanta, Georgia; and bRollins School of Public Health, cSchool of Medicine, and dEmory Vaccine Center, Emory University, Atlanta, Georgia

KEY WORDS human papillomavirus, vaccine, sexual activity, disinhibition

ABBREVIATIONS CI—confidence interval
HPV—human papillomavirus
ICD-9—International Classification of Diseases, Ninth Revision
IRD—incidence rate difference
IRR—incidence rate ratio
MCO—managed care organization
MCV4—quadrivalent meningococcal conjugate vaccine
r2—bivariate correlation coefficient
STI—sexually transmitted infection
Tdap—tetanus toxoid, reduced diphtheria toxoid, and acellular pertussis, adsorbed
VD-NOS—venereal disease, not otherwise specified
All authors are responsible for the reported research. Dr Bednarczyk conceptualized and designed the study, conducted the analysis of and interpreted the data, drafted the initial article and approved the final article as submitted. Dr Davis participated in the conceptualization and design of the study, participated in the analysis and interpretation of the data, reviewed and revised the article, and approved the final article as submitted. Dr Ault participated in the conceptualization and design of the study, participated in the interpretation of the data, reviewed and revised the article, and approved the final article as submitted. Dr Orenstein participated in the conceptualization and design of the study, participated in the interpretation of the data, reviewed and revised the article, and approved the final article as submitted; and Dr Omer participated in the conceptualization and design of the study, participated in the analysis and interpretation of the data, reviewed and revised the article, and approved the final article as submitted.

This study has not been published in any other journal. Portions of this research were presented at the 15th Annual National Foundation for Infectious Diseases Annual Conference on Vaccine Research, Baltimore, MD.

www.pediatrics.org/cgi/doi/10.1542/peds.2012-1516
doi:10.1542/peds.2012-1516

Accepted for publication Jul 6, 2012

Address correspondence to Robert A. Bednarczyk, PhD, Kaiser Permanente Center for Health Research-Southeast, 11 Piedmont Center, 3455 Piedmont Rd NE, Suite 110, Atlanta GA 30305. E-mail: rbednar@emory.edu; robert.a.bednarczyk@smtp.kp.org

(Continued on last page)
In 2006, the Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices recommended that all US girls aged 11 to 12 receive the human papillomavirus (HPV) vaccine, with catch-up vaccination recommended through age 26, and administration permitted as young as 9 years. The recommendation for preteenage girls to be vaccinated against a sexually transmitted infection (STI) is based on the need to develop immunity before HPV exposure.

Early onset of sexual activity and multiple sexual partners are risk factors for HPV infection. Rates of adolescent sexual activity among 15- to 17-year-olds have declined in recent years from 39% in 1995% to 27% between 2006 and 2010. Nearly half of sexually active girls reported >2 sexual partners. Additionally, ~3% of high school girls report initiating sexual activity before age 13. This early initiation of sexual activity is accompanied by a high prevalence of adolescent genital HPV infection, with 33% of 14- to 19-year-olds infected with at least 1 HPV strain, and 12% infected with 1 of the 4 quadrivalent vaccine strains.

Nationally, HPV vaccine 3-dose series initiation among 13- to 17-year-old girls increased from 25% in 2007% to 49% in 2010. The HPV vaccine coverage is lower than the uptake of other recently recommended adolescent vaccines among 13- to 17-year-old girls and boys, such as the combination tetanus toxoid, reduced diphtheria toxoid, and acellular pertussis, adsorbed (Tdap) vaccine (69% in 2010) and quadrivalent meningococcal conjugate vaccine (MCV4, 63% in 2010). Recommendations for Tdap and MCV4 vaccination were approved <18 months before the HPV vaccination recommendation. Barriers to HPV vaccination exist at the structural (cost, multidose series, physicians not encouraging vaccination) and individual (concerns about vaccine safety and fear of needles) levels.

A frequently discussed concern, both in peer-reviewed literature and mass media, about vaccinating preteenage girls against HPV is that vaccination against an STI could lead to increased promiscuity through risk compensation or behavioral disinhibition. Most teenage girls surveyed on knowledge, attitudes, and practices related to HPV vaccination reported they would not modify their sexual behaviors after HPV vaccination. Most of these studies were limited by the use of self-reported, cross-sectional surveys, however, and it is unknown if these survey results would directly translate to clinical outcomes.

To date, there has been no evaluation of changes in sexual activity–related outcomes after HPV vaccination that avoids the risk of response bias that may occur in sexual activity surveys. In this study, we directly examined sexual activity–related outcomes (ie, STI or pregnancy testing or diagnosis, or counseling on contraceptives) among girls enrolled in Kaiser Permanente Georgia, a large managed care organization (MCO) in the metropolitan Atlanta area. Specifically, we evaluated girls in the recommended age range for HPV vaccination (11–12 years) during its first 18 months of availability, with up to 3 years of follow-up to identify outcomes. We sought to test the hypothesis of a clinically meaningful increase (alternative hypothesis incidence rate ratio [IRR] of 1.5) in rates of testing or diagnosis for pregnancy or STIs or physician counseling on contraceptives after receipt of HPV vaccine in this age range.

METHODS

Data on health plan enrollment, vaccination history, and sexual activity–related outcomes of interest (ie, STI, pregnancy testing or diagnosis, or counseling on hormonal contraception) were obtained from clinical/administrative and laboratory databases maintained by the MCO. The cohort comprised girls who had the opportunity to receive the HPV vaccine within the recommended age range (11–12 years) between July 1, 2006 and December 31, 2007, with follow-up for outcomes through December 31, 2010. These time frames were selected to allow up to 3 years of follow-up while increasing homogeneity of the cohort by including girls receiving vaccines only during the prespecified window. Restricting eligibility to girls in the recommended ages for vaccination was done to minimize issues of confounding by indication related to sexually active girls potentially being more likely to seek HPV vaccination, by focusing on girls who were less likely to have already initiated sexual activity.

Girls born between July 2, 1993 and December 31, 1996 and enrolled in the MCO as of July 1, 2006 were identified. Girls were excluded from analysis if they: (1) disenrolled from the MCO before December 31, 2007; (2) received adolescent vaccines of interest after December 31, 2007 or before recommendations for use in the United States (HPV vaccine: July 2006; MCV4: January 2005; Tdap: May 2005); (3) were either <11 years or ≥13 years old when vaccinated; (4) had a history of any outcome of interest on or before December 31, 2007; and (5) did not receive any adolescent vaccines during the study period.

Girls were considered HPV vaccine–exposed if they received at least 1 dose of HPV vaccine, regardless of receipt of any other adolescent vaccine, and HPV vaccine–unexposed if they received any doses of Tdap and/or MCV4 in the absence of HPV vaccination. For the final cohort, follow-up for outcomes began on a common date, January 1, 2008. Person-time at risk began accruing on this date and ended at the first of either (1) the date of incident outcome, (2) MCO disenrollment date, or (3) December 31, 2010. The age at vaccination of interest was the age at
RESULTS

A total of 6795 girls met the initial birth date criteria and were enrolled in the MCO on July 1, 2006. After applying the exclusion criteria, 5393 girls were excluded from the final analysis (1874 disenrolled from the MCO before December 31, 2007; 1817 received vaccine [s] of interest on or after age 13; 678 received vaccine[s] of interest after December 31, 2007; 66 received vaccine [s] of interest before their 11th birthday or vaccine recommendation; 23 had an incident outcome on or before December 31, 2007; and 939 did not receive any adolescent vaccines). Hence, the analysis cohort included 1398 girls.

In this cohort, nearly all girls received either Tdap (93%) or MCV4 (91%), whereas 35% initiated the HPV vaccine series. Exposure classification for analysis resulted in 493 HPV vaccine–exposed girls and 905 HPV vaccine–unexposed girls (Fig 1). Nearly all (474/493) HPV vaccine–exposed girls received at least 1 of the comparison vaccines (Fig 1). The age at vaccination of interest was higher for HPV vaccine–exposed girls than unexposed girls (11.9 years versus 11.6 years, respectively, P < .001). HPV vaccine–exposed girls had more
all-cause medical encounters in the previous year than HPV vaccine–unexposed girls (mean: 2.6 vs 2.1; \( P = .024 \)). HPV vaccine uptake was more common in white girls than in those who were African American. Census tract–level socioeconomic status measures were similar across vaccination groups (Table 1). The Testing/Diagnosis/Counseling outcome was more common than the Diagnosis-Only outcome (Table 1). Girls receiving HPV vaccine did not have a significantly higher incidence rate of Testing/Diagnosis/Counseling (5.5/100 person-years; adjusted IRR: 1.29; 95% CI: 0.92 to 1.80) compared with the HPV vaccine–unexposed group (3.9/100 person-years; IRD: 1.6/100 person-years; 95% CI: —0.03 to 3.24) (Table 2). The Diagnosis-Only incidence rate was low (0.26/100 person-years in the HPV vaccine–exposed group versus 0.25/100 person-years in the HPV vaccine–unexposed group; adjusted IRR: 1.11; 95% CI: 0.26 to 4.64) (Table 2). The mean age at first Testing/Diagnosis/Counseling outcome for HPV vaccine–exposed girls (14.4 years) was similar to that of the unexposed group (14.6 years, \( P = .33 \)). A similar pattern in age at first diagnostic outcome was observed (HPV vaccine–exposed: 14.8 years; HPV vaccine–unexposed: 14.6 years; \( P = .82 \)) (Fig 2). Incidence rates, IRR, and IRD estimates for each of 6 individual secondary outcomes (C. trachomatis testing and diagnosis, pregnancy testing and diagnosis, VD-NOS diagnosis, and contraceptive counseling) are presented in Table 2. No significantly increased IRRs were estimated for individual outcomes comparing HPV vaccine–exposed and unexposed girls. The unadjusted IRD for counseling on contraceptive use was slightly higher in HPV vaccine–exposed girls (0.90/100 person-years, 95% CI: 0.15 to 1.65), although the adjusted IRR was not significantly elevated (2.31, 95% CI: 0.99 to 5.38) (Table 2).

**DISCUSSION**

We present the first evaluation of sexual activity–related outcomes after adolescent HPV vaccination in the recommended age range of 11 to 12 years to use clinical outcomes and show that receipt of HPV vaccine is not associated with an increased rate of sexual activity–related outcomes. This study’s results are not limited by the use of self-reported surveys,\(^{26,27}\) and instead use administrative data from a large MCO. This study provides a clinical validation and extends our understanding of numerous surveys reporting that most young women did not plan to modify their sexual behaviors after HPV vaccination.\(^{15,19–25}\) Although most previous surveys have been cross-sectional, a

---

**TABLE 1** Uptake of Routinely Recommended Adolescent Vaccines and Baseline Health Care–Seeking Behavior Among 11- to 12-Year-Old Girls in a Large MCO, Between July 1, 2006 and December 31, 2007

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vaccination Outcome</th>
<th>HPV Vaccine–Exposed (N=453)</th>
<th>HPV Vaccine–Unexposed (N=905)</th>
<th>( P )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age at vaccination</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age at vaccination of interest, ( y ), mean (SD)( ^a )</td>
<td>11.9 (0.60)</td>
<td>11.6 (0.51)</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Received vaccination of interest when 11 y old, ( N ) (%)( ^b )</td>
<td>272 (55.2)</td>
<td>687 (77.0)</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health care–seeking behavior</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All-cause medical encounters in year before vaccination of interest, mean (SD)( ^c )</td>
<td>2.6 (3.9)</td>
<td>2.1 (3.3)</td>
<td>.024</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Had 0 all-cause medical encounters in year before vaccination of interest, ( N ) (%)( ^d )</td>
<td>104 (21.1)</td>
<td>269 (29.7)</td>
<td>&lt;.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White, ( N ) (%)</td>
<td>189 (38.3)</td>
<td>235 (26.0)</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black, ( N ) (%)</td>
<td>159 (32.3)</td>
<td>389 (43.0)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other, ( N ) (%)</td>
<td>35 (7.1)</td>
<td>52 (5.8)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>110 (22.3)</td>
<td>231 (25.3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socioeconomic status( ^e )</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent of population living at or above poverty level, mean (SD)</td>
<td>87.5 (10.1)</td>
<td>87.2 (8.9)</td>
<td>.579</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent of population with at least a high school diploma or equivalent, mean (SD)</td>
<td>87.0 (8.8)</td>
<td>87.1 (8.2)</td>
<td>.708</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length of enrollment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years enrolled from January 1, 2008, mean (SD)</td>
<td>2.3 (0.82)</td>
<td>2.2 (0.90)</td>
<td>.028</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\( ^a \) For HPV vaccine–exposed, the age at first HPV vaccine dose; for HPV vaccine–unexposed, the earliest age at either first Tdap and/or MCV4 dose.

\( ^b \) As estimated from census tract–level data obtained from 2009 American Community Survey 5-y estimates.

\( ^c \) Socioeconomic status data missing for 2 HPV vaccine–exposed girls and 5 HPV vaccine–unexposed girls.
recent longitudinal survey conducted in the United Kingdom documented no difference in the proportion of women reporting initiation of sexual activity after HPV vaccination; however, that study was conducted in women aged 16 to 18, of whom 37% had already become sexually active. In our analysis, HPV vaccination at ages 11 through 12 did not increase the likelihood of seeking medical attention for outcomes related to sexual activity with up to 3 years of follow-up. This study was designed with sufficient power to detect a meaningful difference in the main outcome by HPV vaccine exposure, so the probability of type II error was relatively low.

Table 2: Incidence Rates and Unadjusted and Adjusted IRRs for Sexual Activity–Related Outcomes After Receipt of Routinely Recommended Adolescent Vaccines Among 11- to 12-Year-Old Girls in a Large MCO, Between January 1, 2008 and December 31, 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>HPV Vaccine–Exposed, N = 493</th>
<th>HPV Vaccine–Unexposed, N = 905</th>
<th>HPV Vaccine–Exposed Versus HPV Vaccine–Unexposed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N per Person-Years IR % Without Outcome</td>
<td>N per Person-Years IR % Without Outcome</td>
<td>aIRR (95% CI) IR Difference (95% CI)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Testing/Diagnosis/Counseling</td>
<td>61/1106 (5.51) 87.63</td>
<td>76/1944 (3.91) 91.8</td>
<td>1.29 (0.92 to 1.80) 1.61 (−0.03 to 3.24)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diagnosis Only</td>
<td>3/1155 (0.26) 99.39</td>
<td>5/2020 (0.25) 98.45</td>
<td>1.11 (0.26 to 4.64) 0.01 (−0.35 to 0.38)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chlamydia testing</td>
<td>25/1159 (2.20) 94.93</td>
<td>30/1979 (1.50) 96.68</td>
<td>1.20 (0.74 to 2.22) 0.88 (−0.32 to 1.71)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chlamydia diagnosis</td>
<td>1/1155 (0.09) 99.8</td>
<td>3/2023 (0.15) 99.97</td>
<td>0.68 (0.06 to 7.71) −0.56 (−0.30 to 1.08)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pregnancy testing</td>
<td>48/1116 (4.32) 90.26</td>
<td>50/1987 (3.02) 93.48</td>
<td>1.28 (0.88 to 1.85) 1.30 (−0.14 to 2.75)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pregnancy diagnosis</td>
<td>2/1156 (0.17) 99.59</td>
<td>2/2024 (0.10) 99.97</td>
<td>0.89 (0.33 to 10.79) 0.07 (−0.20 to 0.33)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VD-NOS diagnosis</td>
<td>1/1155 (0.09) 99.8</td>
<td>2/2023 (0.10) 99.97</td>
<td>0.90 (0.08 to 9.07) −0.01 (−0.23 to 0.21)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counseling on contraceptives</td>
<td>16/1147 (1.39) 96.75</td>
<td>10/2015 (0.50) 99.8</td>
<td>2.31 (0.39 to 5.38) 0.90 (0.15 to 1.65)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following outcomes were adjusted for health care seeking behavior in the previous year, age at vaccination of interest, race, and socioeconomic status: Testing/Diagnosis/Counseling, Chlamydia testing, pregnancy testing, and counseling on contraceptives. The following outcomes were adjusted for health care seeking in the previous year and age at vaccination of interest: Diagnosis Only, Chlamydia diagnosis, and pregnancy diagnosis. The VD-NOS diagnosis outcome was adjusted only for health care seeking in the previous year. Some girls may have had >1 type of testing performed or >1 type of diagnosis. The summary outcomes (Testing/Diagnosis/Counseling and Diagnosis Only) only address the occurrence of any component finding, so the total outcomes for individual components may not add up to the values observed for the summary outcomes. aIRR, adjusted incidence rate ratio; IR, incidence rate (per 100 person-years).
vaccine, and an increased likelihood of condom use among HPV-vaccinated girls, possibly indicating a greater understanding of reproductive health and prevention. A recent study from Australia supports this finding, with HPV-vaccinated women aged 18 to 30 equally likely to be sexually active than nonvaccinated women, with vaccinated women holding stronger attitudes toward safer sexual behaviors, although there was no difference in condom use by vaccination group. Our finding of slightly, but not significantly, increased contraceptive counseling among HPV vaccine-exposed girls supports this previous finding regarding contraception use, and may actually have a positive impact on adolescent preventive health services by establishing a long-term relationship between these girls and their physician. The administrative data used for this study did not provide an opportunity to do a detailed examination of the reasons for this counseling or of the extent of hormonal contraceptive use among girls in this cohort.

We attempted to address issues of confounding by indication related to sexually active girls potentially being more likely to seek HPV vaccination by restricting the analysis to younger girls who are less likely to already be sexually active. Additionally, most health care decisions for girls age 11 through 12 are made by parents or guardians, and it is not likely that perceptions of sexuality led at these ages to the decision to receive the HPV vaccine. If this type of confounding by indication were present, it would result in an overestimation of risk of sexual activity–related outcomes; the lack of significant associations in the presence of potential overestimation further supports our findings.

We identified differences in baseline health care–seeking behavior in the year before receipt of the vaccine of interest. HPV vaccine–exposed girls were more likely to have had any cause medical encounters in this period than HPV vaccine–unexposed girls. Although we adjusted for this difference in health care–seeking behavior in the multivariate regression analysis, there may still be differences between these groups with respect to health care–seeking behaviors, particularly with the need for receipt of 3 doses of HPV vaccine. This increased exposure to health care providers presents more opportunities for medical counseling and evaluation through the adolescent and young adult period.

CONCLUSIONS

Receipt of HPV vaccine by 11- to 12-year-old girls was not associated with clinical markers of increased sexual activity–related outcomes, such as sexually transmitted diseases or pregnancy.
REFERENCES


(Continued from first page)


Hughes CC, Jones AL, Feemster KA, Fiks AG. HPV vaccine decision making in pediatric primary care: a semi-structured interview study. BMC Pediatr. 2011;11:74


FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE: Dr Davis served as Chair of the Data and Safety Monitoring Board for the study “A Post Licensure Surveillance Program for the Safety of Gardasil in a Managed Care Setting,” funded by Merck Pharmaceuticals, Inc. The honoraria for this effort was paid to Kaiser Permanente Georgia, for work occurring from December 2007 through March 2009. Dr Ault has conducted human papillomavirus vaccine clinical trials, with funding paid to his institution by Merck, Roche, and the National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases. Dr Omer was awarded the Maurice R. Hilleman Early-stage Career Investigator Award by the National Foundation for Infectious Diseases. The award was funded by an unrestricted educational grant to the National Foundation for Infectious Diseases from Merck; however, Dr Omer had no direct interaction with Merck. Drs Bednarzyczk and Ørenstein have indicated they have no financial relationships relevant to this article to disclose.

FUNDING: No external funding.
Sexual Activity–Related Outcomes After Human Papillomavirus Vaccination of 11- to 12-Year-Olds
Robert A. Bednarczyk, Robert Davis, Kevin Ault, Walter Orenstein and Saad B. Omer

Pediatrics 2012;130;798; originally published online October 15, 2012;
DOI: 10.1542/peds.2012-1516

The online version of this article, along with updated information and services, is located on the World Wide Web at:
/content/130/5/798.full.html